

10 February

## THE WORLD OF THE SUPRA-SENSORY

ORD # 1812-66

## INTRODUCTION

This paper will discuss the amorphous subject of ESP and related topics, not exhaustively, but with the purpose of informing interested persons, where, by whom and how the extra-sensory world is studied.

It is not the purpose of the author to show any bias, or to take part in a controversy about the existence of ESP. The area is under investigation, and the author only wishes to describe circumstances and persons concerned with these matters. The reader has his own opinion about the reasonableness of the phenomenon and probably would not be swayed by an article written by an anonymous source. It is fair to the audience to know however that the author is a behavior scientist, fully accredited as a Fellow in a Social Science association. He is also an associate member in good standing of a legitimate ESP organization. My sympathies lie in neither extreme side of the validity or non-validity of ESP. It is befitting to state my bias in the biblical quote, "Seek and ye shall find and the truth shall make you free."

## WHAT IS ESP?

The topic of ESP is extraordinarily broad and all encompassing and the initials have been used to describe a multitude of phenomena. Specifically, ESP stands for extra-sensory perception, that is, the reception of information by means other than the customary sensory processes, vision, audition, gustation, olfaction and kinesthesia. Those investigators concerned with phenomena that do not appear well explained or accounted for by the usual means of perception have postulated acquisition of knowledge by the extra-sensory pathway which has not been fully understood or described. Such individuals accept the existence of such an avenue on theoretical assumption or faith, often proclaiming that only future technology and research will provide the appropriate proofs. Be this as it may, the reader should be aware that science does not claim to understand completely the known systems by which we receive and process sensory data. Hypothesizing an unknown or undiscovered system may be begging the question rather than offering a meaningful solution.

All disciplines of science have more than enough researchable problems for examination. Some scientists feel that to wander into such poorly charted seas of the mystical events, notoriously unstable and ephemeral, are rather poor subjects for study in the laboratory where a phenomenon should be reproducible for testing. Repeatability of an event is a basic requirement for a research investigation. Thus, even some clinically observable phenomena are often not considered appropriate subject matter for the laboratory examination.

As a result of this handicap, the investigation of ESP events is left to those who do not require the same research conditions as the usual laboratory scientist. They are willing to tolerate less stable data. They are forced to publish or report their findings in journals and at meetings exclusively attuned to the esoteric. They accept different professional credentials than other professional groups because there is no defined specific training in this area. They have become a clique or guild or, in some cases, a cult, who have a responsibility to demonstrate to colleagues and the public that these events occur and are a legitimate subject for scientific study.

The history of science is replete with examples of subject matter that were considered too unique for serious study, of events which were thought to be beyond scientific examination, findings which were beyond acceptance of the then prominent and influential scientists. For instance, hypnosis was not too long ago considered a somewhat suspicious occurrence, and yet even though still poorly understood, is an acceptable phenomenon of investigation today. Reading through the fingertips or "dermal optical perception," a few short years ago, would have been thought a ludicrous area. Since the Russians have published their studies in the dermal optical effect, two or three American investigators in universities are examining the phenomenon. If results aren't encouraging it will sink back to its previous state of limbo but momentarily it is an "acceptable event." More is mentioned on this topic later. This particular example illustrates a circumstance which is of interest in the changing status of fields for justifiable study. The ESP researchers have been aware of and interested in "finger reading" for some time, but have had little success in convincing their

more conservative colleagues that such a phenomenon could reasonably exist. However, after the Russians became interested and a new name was applied, the same phenomenon gained respectability. It can be anticipated that other such events will also gain equal acceptance.

Lest the reader conclude that the author is favoring the ESP position unfairly, let it be said that science progresses cautiously and is not hurried into studying matters without due consideration of the likelihood of reasonable solutions. Practical or political conditions also tend to influence the direction of science and the funding mechanisms of governments or foundations can and do often determine the importance and attractiveness of an area for study. If the Russians are interested, then the West must at least keep its scientific eye alert. Needless to say, the Chinese will do the same. As far as ESP is concerned, there has been some concern displayed by both camps, but it has been a cautious and suspicious entry into this field carefully disguised in terms less esoteric--such as dermal optical phenomena and sensory processes.

It should be remembered that when such penetrations are made into science, ESP studies are not generally supported through the paranormal investigators but rather through the more conservative scientist as an adjunct to his normal research interest.

Thus, it can be seen that ESP, although often neglected by the scientific community, does get its attention when stimulation of money, political or practical events occur.

## **SOME SPECIFICS OF THE PHENOMENON**

When ESP is mentioned, one usually thinks of such terms as telepathy (reading another's thoughts, or communication between two minds without intervening spoken or written words), clairvoyance (recognition or perception of an event or circumstance of which no one else is aware), precognition (knowledge of an event or circumstance prior to its occurrence), psychokinesis (manipulation of physical entities by thought energy). These are familiar areas of the paranormal that receive considerable attention. At the same time, such topics as survival of personality after death, poltergeist, visions, faith healing, medium behavior and a host of occult phenomena seem also to be proper subjects of study. It is an undefined area but basically concerns events that appear to depend on energy, not generally perceived or received by ordinary sensory systems. The events are difficult to reproduce under appropriate conditions for study. They are also experiences that are private, subjective and often emotion-laden. They are not common to everyone, which limits their understanding and opportunity for study. Possibly our cultural attitudes toward the occult may be a factor in reducing the number of cases made public, but even if there were indications of more data, the nature of the phenomena is still terribly elusive.

## **METHODOLOGY**

ESP researchers have attempted for years to utilize the techniques and experimental methods of the physical scientists in order to treat their data effectively and to follow the lead of their more rigorous colleagues. Their efforts represent, at times, a somewhat inadequate bow in the direction

of appropriate controls and a somewhat superficial understanding of real experimental methodology. Because of the nature of their studies, small numbers of subjects are generally available and, therefore, their results are completely dependent on the application of statistics. The data may be shown to be statistically significant, but often the non-parametric techniques are applied after the data is collected and it is not part of the basic experimental plan. In addition, it can often be seen that pertinent variables are not controlled, and thus the data, though significant from a statistical viewpoint, may be inadequate. In addition, some of the psychological tests or questionnaires that are used have not been carefully prepared or adequately validated on other populations. This tends, therefore, to give less credence to their findings.

Many of the instances of ESP phenomena are of such a nature that they must be studied under non-laboratory or natural conditions. Such instances make it extremely difficult to control those variables which may be determining factors in such studies. In actuality, a clinical or judgmental approach would be a much more satisfactory technique of investigation than to attempt any elaborate experimental procedures. In order to overcome these difficulties, the ESP investigator often employs very sophisticated electronic equipment for measures. Unfortunately, often these investigators are not sophisticated in the operation of such equipment, nor in the interpretation of its data. Therefore, such instrumentation does not add to the reliability of the information. It is rather obvious that the psychic experience is an emotional laden situation which also prevents a systematic, objective laboratory approach to the problem. Again, the clinical methodology is probably more effective. The experimental techniques which might be applied would be

most appropriate in an examination of conditions under which such phenomena might be induced. Experimental procedures have been developed in the area of hypnosis, drug studies, etc., which might contribute to studies of psychic phenomena. In general, the author feels that the ESP researcher tries too hard to apply experimental methodology which may be inappropriate to the phenomena under investigation. He would do better to isolate clinically the variables which could perhaps be studied in part under laboratory conditions. A good, thorough, objective clinical assessment would be as successful in selling this type of research as inappropriately applied experimental methods based on statistical significance which may or may not be psychologically pertinent.

Further examination of the physical deprivation techniques, the simulation of battlefied stress, procedures used by military psychologists, may be appropriate for the study of some of these conditions.

#### RESEARCHER ATTITUDES

Something must be mentioned about the experimenter attitude in studies of these phenomena. The ESP investigator, in general, takes a sympathetic view of his subject. He is proving a case for ESP. In general, the psychologist involved in studies of ESP is as emotionally involved, but on the opposite end of the scale. He feels threatened and negative toward such unexplained phenomena, therefore, tends to depreciate results and consciously or unconsciously control subjects under study.

It is somewhat reinforcing to find new scientists who are willing to look at the ESP area without preconceived notions of its existence or non-existence, but rather are motivated from the point of view that this is an

interesting area of study which should be given the attention. Recently, a few investigators have come to the fore and seem to be well qualified and seem to understand when to apply rigorous control and how to adjust variables in the appropriate fashion. It is the author's belief that these investigators have a major contribution to make to the field. It is reinforcing to find them continuing their professional relationships with their more conservative colleagues, and yet, at the same time, publishing in the journals of parapsychology.

From a methodological point of view, the author would recommend that ESP be studied from a naturalistic or phenomenological approach, that clinical judgment be utilized until aspects of psychic phenomena can be identified for appropriate study under laboratory conditions. It is my belief that some of the phenomena can be treated effectively, but only by the most sophisticated investigators. Dr. Martin Orne has shown that the demands of the investigator under ordinary conditions can sway the results of an experiment by conscious or unconscious manipulation of subjects. These findings throw in doubt many of the behavioral studies that have already been done in a variety of areas and certainly would cast doubt on some of the positive findings of the parapsychologist. It is, therefore, necessary that future research in psychic phenomena be conducted with the utmost care and by more highly trained and sophisticated research personnel.

#### RESEARCH EFFORTS IN ESP

It is difficult to describe research programs of any field but particularly hard to give an overview of ESP. First, the diversity of the phenomena would make it a never-ending report and secondly, there seems to be

many more



many interested investigators who know one another informally but are not members of institutions or professional associations. Of course, the major ESP centers are obvious, however, there is considerable fractionization in the field and the journals and meetings of the paranormal do not really represent the general population of investigators or interested parties.

The author will attempt to discuss the organizations and investigators of which he is aware who seem to have more than a passing interest in these topics.

#### THE DUKE COMPLEX

Probably the best known ESP research center in the world was that at Duke University under the direction of Dr. J. B. Rhine. This laboratory was founded over 30 years ago and served as a focal point of research and publication for ESP studies. In 1964 Rhine founded the "Foundation for the Study of the Nature of Man" located also in Durham, North Carolina. The University laboratories were closed and Rhine is continuing his studies through the Foundation. Associated with him has been the Psychical Research Foundation, Inc., whose director, Mr. W. G. Roll, is primarily interested in the study of post-mortem survival. Other staff members include Dr. Louise A. Rhine (Mrs. Rhine) who has written several articles and books on ESP, visiting investigators on fellowships or staff appointments from the United States and other countries. The Duke laboratory has served as a training ground for many of the parapsychologists throughout the world. This training function has made Duke, in the past, ESP's Mecca and helped Dr. Rhine become a very influential man in this field of endeavor. In fact, he has been perhaps more prominent than many have been in the best interest of ESP, since

it is alleged by some that the "science of ESP" has not broadened or grown as it might under the leadership of a less charismatic figure. All sciences have their leaders, but usually that leadership is restricted to personal research and writing. His influence has encompassed research methodology and funding allocation more than might be customary. The Carolina complex has many aspects of a center that has offered research stimulation and has served as a clearing house of approved research.

The research done at Duke covers a variety of subjects, but principally concerned with laboratory investigations of ESP utilizing Zener (ESP cards), dice manipulation, testing of sensitives. In addition, the laboratory was a methodological proving ground for ways in which phenomena might be studied.

It also served as the publication center, and thus a review point for articles reporting ESP research around the world. Most of the articles are of studies done with techniques and tests developed at Duke or by Duke-affiliated people. The journals published are the Journal of Parapsychology and the Parapsychological Bulletin. Many of the studies are described in statistical terms reporting that a set of conditions resulted in demonstrating a significance beyond chance of the ESP phenomena. Generally, the statistics are correctly used, but the experimental conditions may be open to question because some variables have not been appropriately controlled. It is the author's impression that the treatment of statistical data, although technically correct, is naive and may be statistically significant, but not psychologically pertinent. Few scientists other than members of the immediate field read these articles regularly and, therefore, there is little constructive criticism given to methodology or procedures. The author has noted that members of the group do not always ask penetrating questions

concerning procedures of their colleagues either because they feel they must "trust" each other's experimental skills or they do not comprehend the real meaning of the scientific techniques. (Most scientists have little compunction to inquire of another's procedures. No one expects protection through courtesy and none assumes infallibility in experimental design.)

Interestingly enough, a paranormal investigator occasionally publicly impugns another's motives rather than his experimental procedures. Some of the comments that are written in these journals about questionable research can be less than polite.

In recent times, the influence of the Rhine complex has declined. There are now more centers of study, such as the University of Virginia and the University of California in Los Angeles. This is a natural evolution because of greater acceptance of this field in general.

However, Rhine's laboratory was and is influential in other parts of the world because of its scholarship and fellowship funds. Dr. K. Rosakrishmir Rao of India has been at Duke for three years and reports that his government has asked him to set up a research center in ESP when he returns. Dr. Milar Ryzl of Prague, Czechoslovakia, has been supported by funds from Duke for three years. His research has been concentrated on one subject who seems to be a very sensitive individual. His skill is reporting stimulus cards in sealed envelopes. Several Western parapsychologists, including Gaither Pratt and Ian Stevenson of the University of Virginia, and Stephen Abrams of Oxford, have worked with Ryzl in Prague. Ryzl also has kept Dr. Rhine briefed (by letter) on ESP research in some of the Iron Curtain countries.

Mr. Soji Otani, Assistant Professor of Psychology, Japanese Defense Academy, spent a year at Duke and will continue his studies in Japan. Dr. Bruno Osetto recently set up a parapsychology laboratory in Chile. These are examples of the foreign interest that has been spawned by Rhine.

#### OTHER CENTERS OF ESP

The second most prominent group in the field is the American Society of Psychical Research located in New York City. It is headed by Dr. Gardner Murphy (also of Menninger Clinic). Dr. Carlos Osis is the research director. The society's prime interest is to collect, evaluate and report evidence of psychic phenomena. It is an outgrowth of the British Society started over a hundred years ago for the same purpose. There have been many distinguished names among the members of these societies, all of whom are or were dedicated to understanding the esoteric. Any such group varies in its ability to evaluate psychic events scientifically, but certainly the society collected more anecdotal data than any other organization. The members are sincere with a bias toward believing such events occur. However, they do try to maintain objectivity. The American Society is in competent research hands. Their present efforts are concentrated on studying the relationship between ESP and creativity sponsored by the Ittleson Family Foundation. In addition to this program, Dr. Osis has been interested in patient behavior prior to death as reported by trained observers and medical personnel. This research is an attempt to explore impressions, verbal reports, and sensory information just before death.

Like many groups concerned with the occult, the society's staff becomes involved in all related phenomena from investigating the honesty of mediums to enhancement of ESP under drugs. Much of their interests are revealed

in their lecture series and their publication, Journal of Psychical Research (a quarterly). Membership is open to all who express an interest in psychic phenomena.

There are really quite a number of experienced ESP investigators and at the same time few organizations sponsoring their studies. It is notable that there tends to be some mobility from one group to another as a result. For example, a few years ago, Dr. Osis was research director of the Parapsychological Foundation in New York. This group is headed by Mrs. Elaine Garrett, a medium of some note. The foundation publishes the magazine Tomorrow, which is a more popularly written version of an ESP journal.

Three years ago, Dr. Osis and Mr. Douglas Dean left the Foundation, Dr. Osis to the American Society and Mr. Dean to the Newark Engineering School. The Foundation still functions, sponsoring research, but does in-house. They recently sponsored work in hypnosis and ESP, which is a vogue area at the moment.

#### THE PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION

The three groups mentioned have had considerable influence in the major ESP organization, the Parapsychological Association. This is the professional group which holds annual meetings, for paper presentation and policy planning for many of the parapsychologists throughout the world. One can hold associate status with no real specific academic requirements and member status, if one engages in and reports ESP research. To attend these meetings one must be vouched for by a bonafide member of the association. This is an attempt to keep out troublesome individuals who are apt to be fascinated by the title and the organization's program.

The quality of the papers at these meetings is uneven. Generally, they are of a less rigorous quality than at other professional groups, particularly in the description of experimental methodology. Some critiquing occurs but usually the atmosphere is one of "togetherness" and mutual support. Some unpleasant situations have developed as the result of personal differences within the group. There are few members in the association who are eligible to hold office so there can be difficulty concerning who is appropriate to serve next. In the last few years, Rhine's establishment of the Foundation has caused some splits in the group which are not totally healed yet.

The association has sought recognition for Parapsychology in scientific circles, but with little success. They attempted recently to become affiliated with the American Association for the Advancement of Science, but were refused. There are several countries represented in the PA and last year the annual meeting was held in England to satisfy European members. In general, however, the organization is American dominated and run. Although not politically or professionally powerful, it serves as an identification and reinforcement mechanism for the out-group of parascientists.

One of the better known and highly respected members of the Parapsychological Association and formerly with Dr. Rhine for 25 years is Dr. Gaither Pratt, presently at the University of Virginia, Medical School. His principal interest at present is the identification of good ESP subjects at the University of Virginia. He recently authored a book and is also lecturing on ESP throughout the country.

Dr. Pratt has visited Ruzyl twice in Prague and has made two trips to Russia to discuss ESP with Professor Vasiliev and other interested scientists.

He is probably better informed on this type of research being done around the world than any other single individual.

There are other investigators who might be mentioned in connection with the Rhine group and the Association, but it would make tedious reading. Some of the better known individuals are: Dr. Gertrude Schneider, City College, New York; Dr. Carroll B. Nash, St. Joseph's College, Philadelphia, Pa.; Dr. John Freeman, Institute of Parapsychology, Durham, North Carolina; Mrs. Sally Feather, Psychiatry Department, Duke University Hospital, Durham, North Carolina; Dr. R. A. McConnell, Biophysics Department, University of Pittsburgh; Dr. Montague Ullman, 4802 10th Avenue, Brooklyn, New York; Mrs. Rhea White, Westburgh, Long Island; Dr. Lawrence Cusler, City College, New York.

#### THE NON-PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION INVESTIGATORS

The previous section describes briefly one world of parapsychology. There are many other interested individuals, but for one reason or another, have not become closely associated with Dr. Rhine or the Parapsychological Association.

Dr. Andrija Puharich, presently associated with the Intelectron Corp., has had a long-time interest in the occult. He was director of a nonprofit foundation in Maine for several years where he studied various sensitives under "scientific" conditions. Among other things, he was responsible for bringing Peter Hurkos to this country. Mr. Hurkos has become a relatively well-known sensitive who quite often receives attention in the press for his exploits. More will be said of him later. Dr. Puharich has been interested in the effect of drugs on the mind and wrote "The Sacred Mushroom" about the mushroom eater of South America. He also wrote "Beyond Telepathy" which is

a collection of occult observations and ESP research. Dr. Puharich is a very personable individual who has a broad scope of interests beyond the occult area. He is quite a sophisticated person and is well informed about parapsychology. At present, Dr. Puharich is concerned with bio-medical research and development at the Intelectron Corp., and he does make only an occasional research foray in ESP.

One of the better known European centers of ESP is at the University of Utrecht under the Direction of Dr. W.H.C. Tenhoeff. He is chairman of the Department of Parapsychology and has gained considerable publicity through his prize sensitive, Mr. Croisett. Many popular articles have been written of Croisett's ability to locate lost or missing people and to heal the sick. A popular book has been written entitled, "Croisett the Clairvoyant," which describes his life and gifts. Much of the Sunday supplement claims of Mr. Croisett are generally thought to be exaggerated, but he is still sought after and periodically the subject of some new "scientific study." Dr. Tenhoeff does a few studies occasionally in ESP, but is principally known for his gifted protege. In 1964, Mr. Croisett was brought to the U.S. by the American Society of Psychical Research for study at Rockland State Hospital.

Peter Hurkos should be treated somewhat separately, since he has become a great celebrity on the sensitive scene. He is a Dutchman who was injured in a fall many years ago. According to his own story, upon recovering consciousness after three days, he found that he was receiving a considerable amount of information, through his sensory systems, which he found confusing and difficult to understand. He was put under medical care and after a while, he began to be able to handle this information successfully. In a



sense, he was receiving impressions, ideas, pictures that are not ordinarily part of our everyday experience. This way he allegedly gained knowledge unavailable to most of the other people. His demonstrations of this ability have been relatively impressive. He can tell from an object owned by someone and give considerable information about the individual. It is difficult to know whether it is as accurate as indicated, but in the demonstrations, the subjects seem, at least, to agree with his statements.

The life of the sensitive is not an easy one, particularly when he has been transplanted into a new culture. Mr. Hurkos has had to perform publicly in order to earn sufficient money to live. He has been given publicity which has, in a sense, perhaps made him feel more famous than he should. As a result, he has lived a much different life than he might have anticipated. Because of the strong pressure of entertainment and in public demonstration of skills, he has adopted behaviors that will help make him look more sensational. Therefore, he is an extremely difficult subject to study with any degree of objectivity. He needs to succeed and, therefore, will adjust his performance for maximum success. He has developed many manners of the showman and, unfortunately therefore, may give the impression of being insincere. It is doubtful that he would be a good subject for a long-term scientific investigation. However, he will always titillate the interest of the audience and does do some unusual things. As noted previously, he was brought to the U.S. by Dr. A. Puharich and was studied in Maine for some months.

#### ASSOCIATES OF PARAPSYCHOLOGY

For a number of years, there have been people in the Washington area who have been intrigued with the area of ESP and the occult. They are not associated with the Duke laboratories or any specific ESP center. Their interests are not to conduct research, but rather to watch demonstrations and encourage granting organizations to give money for research in ESP. In general, I would say they have little influence on procurement of funds, but they are an interesting group. Dr. Riesenman, a psychiatrist, has been one of the most active individuals here in Washington. He is extremely skillful in sleight-of-hand and has spent a good deal of time attempting to duplicate and imitate ESP phenomena, particularly in the card reading area. He is a most knowledgeable individual about the occult scene and seems to have contact with many of its leading personalities. He has held sessions in his home in Virginia and seems to be somewhat of a center of these activities. Dr. Riesenman seems to be convinced that these phenomena exist and has been a hardy supporter of such individuals as Peter Hurkos. He has been an advisor to the local police force, who on occasion have hired people such as Peter Hurkos to look into missing persons or murder cases.

Mr. William C. Moore, a Washington lawyer, is concerned with the progress of ESP. He seems quite knowledgeable of the field in general and demonstrations conducted in the area and keeps abreast of research being conducted in the field. He is more of a communicator than an investigator and often arranges meetings for people with similar interests.

**ENGLISH ESP**

England has always had a soft spot for its ghosts and mediums. The Psychical Society was started there and interest in the occult still lives amongst all levels of British society. It would be impossible to describe all those personalities who dedicate some time and energy to this interest but let a few names be representative. Oxford has, through grants, supported the research of one Stephen Abrams, a proverbial Yank at Oxford. Mr. Abrams did most of his studies at the Biometry Department from 1960 to 1963. He was particularly concerned with ESP and hypnosis and spent much of his time with a few particularly good subjects. He also worked with Mr. Shackleton, who is quite famous in England as a sensitive. Their experiment concerned the transmission of drawings from the artist to Shackleton in another room. Unfortunately, the data, although intriguing, could not be analyzed by any valid or reliable method. They would be of clinical interest however.

Mr. Abrams' research, although of interest, never really progressed beyond the pilot stage, because of other commitments and funding difficulties. At present, he is seeking support for a telecommunications laboratory to be located in England.

Mr. Abrams established rather good rapport with Professor Vasiliev and his colleagues and visited Moscow and Leningrad to lecture.

There are several other noted ESP advocates in England who have written several books and articles. Professor S. G. Soal of London is one of the most noted investigators and has published an excellent book entitled "Modern Experiments in Telepathy" which is a superior review of the research done in ESP. Mrs. Rosalind Heywood of London is an avid fan of the occult, although she has little professional training she is a very bright and

relatively effective person. She is a believer but one who seems to be well balanced. Her book "Beyond the Reach of Sense" is well written.

Some of the prominent names in other fields who participate in ESP studies are Sir Alistair Hardy, the well-known biologist at Oxford (he served as the artist in Abrams-Shackleton experiment). Professor C. D. Broad, the famous philosopher at Cambridge, is on the Board of Directors of the British Society of Psychical Research and has written many interesting articles on the topic of ESP. Professor H. H. Price, philosopher at Oxford, is an active participant in the field and recently gave a lecture on mesokinesis and ESP here in the United States.

Sir Cyril Burt, psychologist and statistician of great note, has written on the subject and been active in assisting in the research of others.

Professor W. Grey Walters, an internationally known cyberneticist and brain physiologist of England, is an advisor to the Society of Psychical Research.

The general atmosphere in England, particularly in dealing with some of the above mentioned luminaries, is one of extreme empathy for the ESP or occult investigator. However, there was also the feeling, at least, perceived by the author that there is little interest on their part to look at the "nuts and bolts" of scientific validation of these phenomena. Again, the need to "accept" the researcher's word was obvious as if "gentlemen don't question each other's techniques"--a totally inexcusable attitude for the typical scientist who needs to know such information for complete understanding of the experiment. These individuals, in general, accept the occult and aren't terribly concerned with those who don't--a much more mature attitude in some ways than that demonstrated in the United States.

Nonetheless, this approach will do little to advance the reputation of ESP in scientific circles. At least, their more informal relaxed and confident air is refreshing.

It was in England that much of the Russian ESP effort was reported by Stephen Abrams in May 1962, who had recently returned from Vasiliev's laboratory. It would be interesting to speculate who has encouraged whom to become interested in ESP. There is some indication that the "Nautilus Story" which was publicized by THIS WEEK, a Sunday supplement, on September 8, 1963, may have started much of this activity. The transmission of ESP signals from a submerged U.S. submarine to a land base was first reported in a French newspaper in 1959. It is quite possible that this false report, repeated in many publications and by word of mouth caused the Russians to worry that the U.S. had a breakthrough in this area. Perhaps at the same time, the amazing story stirred some of the U.S. scientists to rethink their own opinions of ESP. Regardless, since that general time frame, there have been indications of considerable activities in both sides of the curtain. The Russian work is difficult to evaluate because of the many confusing reports and articles by visitors who seem to see that which they are motivated to see. Some of what has been said to be ongoing research is in reality old research. Some of the visitors have even reported statements made by extremely prominent Soviet scientists that we are sure were simple cases of mistaken identity. Other people, however, have picked up this misinformation and it is repeated without source reference and assumed to be new data. As a result, most recent claims in the Browning-Stone book, this writer feels, is perhaps exaggerated.

Professor Vasiliev is the best known in the field. He is Professor of Physiology at the University of Leningrad. His work was reported to be monitored by a committee headed by Professor E. A. Asratian, Director of the Institute of Higher Nervous Activity and Neurophysiology of the Academy of Science. There is some doubt concerning the validity of ESP research and, therefore, this committee serves as advisor. Vasiliev's staff consists of physiologists, electronic specialists, physicists, cyberneticists and a psychiatrist. Juri Tupitsin, the psychiatrist and Pavel Terentiev, a statistician, are considered key men. The project administrator is Alga Ienz, a party functionary.

According to one source, the Russians appear to be well-acquainted with American research in this area. They seem, however, oriented toward the approach of the early French school. It is to be remembered that Vasiliev is a student of Bekhterev, who in turn was a protege of Charcot's.

Their theoretical position, as reported by this same source, hypothesizes ESP energy as a radiated form emanating from the brain and called biological radio communication. In order to test this position, the Russians have encased their experimenters in shielded rooms during experiments. Such shielding seems to have no effect, in other words, allegedly ESP or thought transfer occurs through shielding.

Further studies concerning radiated energy are being conducted with electroscopes by a physicist named B. B. Kozumski who utilizes the Faraday Cage. Also interested in this approach is Dr. Mirza of the Institute of Neurophysiology. "Experiments in Mental Suggestions" by L. L. Vasiliev, published in England, 1963, is one of the more interesting.

#### FINGER READING

Professor Gregory Razran, Chairman of the Psychology Department, Queens College, New York, has been much interested in this dermal optical phenomenon and visited Russia when the subject was under study. His report at a District of Columbia Psychological Association Meeting in 1965 reviewed the field and left the impression that he believed the Russian research was competently handled and that it was worthy of attention. Since that time, he has, in public articles, shown his continued support of his observation by indicating that articles to the contrary that appeared in the Russian press were not a proper interpretation of the scientist's view.

He has not undertaken research in this area himself, but has encouraged others such as Dr. Richard Youtz of Barnard College, New York, to investigate known cases.

The author has witnessed on two or three occasions this phenomenon in an American subject and found the individual demonstrating behavior quite beyond his own abilities. Others who have observed believe fraud is involved and so it goes... As yet, such cases of unusual behavior do not always get objective study because of funding limitations or experimenter bias. This particular area will continue to receive attention so long as convincing cases or subjects are available.

#### PRESSURE FOR FUNDING

As previously mentioned, there is still considerable pressure for more funding of research in the ESP field. Various industrial companies have sponsored the writing and submission of occasional proposals to various

private or governmental agencies. These are usually sparked by a need to get a quick answer to a problem not easily solved in a conventional manner.

For example, the difficulty of communicating across great distances in space has given the ESP enthusiast inroads that were previously denied because he supports the view that "mental energy" can be transmitted instantaneously. In a way, ESP is suggested as a panacea for problems which at the moment may be or seem to be beyond the "state of the art" of the usual discipline.

R. W. Lowrie's paper, "Aspects of Parapsychology in Communication," presented at a conference on "Cybernetic Aspects of Man-Machine Relationships" at the University of Florida on 13 February 1965, is an example of a plea for greater attention to the potential of ESP. This review unfortunately, like most, cannot give appropriate weight to the meaningfulness of the basic data upon which the papers are based. More in these esoteric areas than others is it necessary to know the competence and the methodology of the investigator before his results can be accepted as scientifically sound and relevant. The extra care is not exercised because of a question of deliberate fraud, but rather because of investigator bias, naivete, and the inapplicability of some standard methodologies to these rather elusive phenomena. Thus, merely quoting results and findings of past research without intimate knowledge of the research circumstances can be misleading and perhaps overoptimistic.

#### WHAT IS THE FUTURE OF ESP AND RELATED RESEARCH?

As long as man searches for an understanding of his environment and speculates on the rationale of his place in the universe, he will continue to be intrigued with the esoteric.



Further breakthroughs which give more sophisticated techniques for understanding the functioning of the mind and body perhaps will erode the fuzziness of ESP claims and permit more precise studies of these now ephemeral gifts or powers. Unfortunately, as has been indicated, the parapsychologist is not apt to have the technical skills to utilize the equipment and methodology relevant to the problems and progress will be made by the other scientists as an adjunct to their more conservative interests.

There are a number of research studies now in progress of acceptable worth that will at least bear peripheral interest to the study of ESP phenomena.

1. Concern with interpersonal interactions--somewhere here the social or behavioral scientist is conscious of the as-yet unmeasured cues which are registered, processed, integrated and used to assess other persons. We know that individuals vary in their ability to be aware of the reaction capability of these. We refer to this as sensitivity and classify individuals along such a continuum. This skill, or gift, is not completely understood but so far it is not considered extra sensory. Perhaps it could be called supra sensitivity. All sensory inputs contributing to a more-accurate-than-average assessment and prediction of how this individual behaves.

Studies systematically exploring cues utilized by persons defined as operating on this supra sensory level would help us identify the subtle behaviors which are so rich in predictive information. It seems reasonable to believe that top-notch salesmen operate on such cues, as do confidence men and highly skilled diagnosticians.

Is this sensitivity a product of an unusual neurological structure? Is it a conceptual thought processing system, unique to some? Or is it perhaps

a single or multiple, highly developed sensory path which we presently do not measure effectively (an acute olfactory sense combined with other data)?

Research in this area is feasible with present techniques and may well contribute to understanding of some aspects of the more ephemeral phenomena.

2. Environmental factors in which we operate as creatures of the universe have long been suspected of having effects on behavior. Studies in climatology, radiation and meteorology are gaining prominence and attention. There are many less than impressive researchers in this area, but with the development of appropriate measuring tools and the pressure to know more about environmental and ecological factors, better scientists are becoming interested.

The research on ionization effect on behavior and health is spotty but promising. Atmospheric conditions and their mark on the body and mind is moving from old wives tale status to systematic documentation. Even effects of gravitational factors of earth and other planets are beginning to go beyond the astrologist charts. Radiation, man induced and natural, has come under scrutiny by the scientific community when before all of these subjects were discussed in science fiction or the occult. Science is bringing system to such studies, speculation is structured as testable hypotheses rather than hopes. Identification of the appropriate variables are sought in order to identify the conditions under which the phenomena can be controlled, studied and eventually isolated for cause and effect relationships. When this is accomplished, then the phenomenon can be understood and put in its proper place in the system of knowledge.

3. Fundamental to any research in the esoteric is a real understanding of neurological function of man. There is considerable research possible

today with the development of bioelectronic apparatus and computers that were only in the hypothesis stage in the past. Through these studies, we hope to relate behavior specifically to neurological and biochemical events of the human mechanism. Such findings will begin to permit control and manipulation of the sensory-motor systems and the brain so that the limits of our neurological input systems can be evaluated. At the same time, function can be identified with structure.

4. Research on memory has been a popular pastime for the dabbling of investigations for many years starting seriously from a laboratory approach by Ebbinghaus in 1885. Most of our knowledge is concentrated in the short-term basis because of the difficulties of studying subjects under controlled conditions for long periods of time. This neglect of an important knowledge area is slowly being corrected or adjusted. The theoretical implications from a functional as well as organic approach to the storage of information may have major implications for the E research.

5. The use of computers for analysis of complex data and manipulation of response order would appear to be a tool with which new and old research data can be examined. These techniques are certainly promising as means of "milking" information and for isolating trends of subjects in their "hits" or "misses" when responding to the standard ESP experiments. Some investigators in the field are quite excited about the computer's potential.

This is not a complete review of the ESP field, nor can one be written because of the constant changes imposed on persons, attitudes, and situations. The paper should, however, give the reader a smattering of knowledge about the complexity of evaluating the findings of such research.

**SG1D**

**Approved For Release 2001/03/07 : CIA-RDP96-00787R000400040032-1**

**Approved For Release 2001/03/07 : CIA-RDP96-00787R000400040032-1**

|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|---------------------|------------|----------|---------------|---------------------------------------|-----------|
|                     |            | SEC. CL. | ORIGIN        | CONTROL NO.                           |           |
| DATE OF DOC         | DATE REC'D | DATE OUT | SUSPENSE DATE | CROSS REFERENCE OR<br>POINT OF FILING |           |
| TO<br>FROM<br>SUBJ. |            |          |               | ROUTING                               | DATE SENT |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
|                     |            |          |               |                                       |           |
| COURIER NO.         | ANSWERED   | NO REPLY |               |                                       | 4         |